CINEMA OF BIMAL ROY

Dr Shoma A. Chatterji
SUPPORT LIVE ENCOUNTERS.
DONATE NOW AND KEEP THE MAGAZINE LIVE IN 2017!

Live Encounters is a not-for-profit free online magazine that was founded in 2009 in Bali, Indonesia. It showcases some of the best writing from around the world. Civil and human rights activists, animal rights activists, poets, writers, journalists, social workers and more have contributed their time and knowledge for the benefit of the readers of the magazine.

We are appealing for donations to pay for the administrative and technical aspects of the publication. Please help spread the free distribution of knowledge with any amount that you feel you want to give for this just cause.

BANK DETAILS
Sarita Kaul
A/C : 0148748640
Swift Code : BNINIDJAXXX
PT Bank Negara Indonesia (Persero) Tbk
Kantor Cabang Utama Denpasar
Jl. Gajah Mada
Denpasar, Bali, Indonesia

Om Shanti Shanti Shanti Om
markulyseas@liveencounters.net

All articles and photographs are the copyright of www.liveencounters.net and its contributors. No part of this publication may be reproduced without the explicit written permission of www.liveencounters.net. Offenders will be criminally prosecuted to the full extent of the law prevailing in their home country and/or elsewhere.

Cover photograph Mark Ulyseas
The Cinema of Bimal Roy
Dr Shoma A. Chatterji

Dr Shoma A. Chatterji is a freelance journalist, film scholar and author based in Kolkata with a master's degree in Economics and in Education; PhD in History (Indian Cinema) and a Senior Research Post-doctoral Fellowship from the ICSSR. She has won two National Awards for Best Writing on Cinema—Best Film Critic in 1991 and Best Book on cinema in 2002. She won the Bengal Film Journalists Association's Best Critic Award in 1998, the Bharat Nirman Award for excellence in Journalism in 2004, a research fellowship from the National Film Archive of India in 2005–2006, a Senior Research Fellowship from the PSBT Delhi in 2006–2007.

America at Cross-Roads?
Dr Namrata Goswami

Dr. Namrata Goswami is one of the foremost Indian thinkers on long-term global trends, emerging security challenges, and scenario building. She is currently an Independent Senior Analyst. Dr Goswami was formerly Research Fellow at the Institute for Defence Studies and Analyses (IDSA), New Delhi where she specialized on ethnic conflicts, insurgency, counter-insurgency and conflict resolution. She was a Jennings Randolph Senior Fellow at the United States Institute of Peace, Washington, D.C., She is a recipient of the Fulbright-Nehru Senior Fellowship.

The ‘al Qaeda’ stream of Kashmir Militancy
Dr Bibhu Prasad Routray

Dr. Routray served as a Deputy Director in the National Security Council Secretariat, Govt of India, Director of the Institute for Conflict Management (ICM)’s Database & Documentation Centre, Guwahati, Assam. He was a Visiting Research Fellow at the South Asia programme of the S. Rajaratnam School of International Studies, the Institute for Conflict Management (ICM)’s Database & Documentation Centre, Guwahati, Assam. He was a Visiting Research Fellow at the South Asia programme of the S. Rajaratnam School of International Studies, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore between 2010 and 2012.

America’s Arunachal WWII MIA - Letter to PM Modi and President Trump
Gary Zaetz

Gary Zaetz is the founder and chairman of the US-based advocacy group Families and Supporters of America’s Arunachal Missing in Action, founded to press the Indian and US Governments to permit recovery operations for the remains of 400 missing in action US servicemen killed in air crashes in Arunachal Pradesh during World War II. He trekked to his uncle’s crash site in the mountains of Arunachal in 2008. He earned a master’s degree in political science from Massachusetts Institute of Technology in 1978.

Goa CM Manohar Parrikar Quis custodiet ipsos custodes?
Mark Ulyseas


Yogyakarta
Jill Gocher

Bali based international photographer has spent her life exploring and enjoying Asian cultures. Her work has appeared in National Geographic, Time, International Herald Tribune, Asia Spa, Discovery, Silver Kris and many more. Her Books - Asia’s legendary Hotels, Perilous, Bali - Island of Light - Marshall Cavendish, Indonesia - Islands of the Imagination, Perilous, Australia - the land down under - Times Editions, Singapore, Indonesia - the last paradise - Times Editions. She has held exhibitions in Singapore, Kathmandu, and Bali.

Bearong Namu - Crepe Myrtle Tree
Mikyoung Cha

Mikyoung Cha is a graduate in Oriental Painting from Hyungshin Women’s University, Daegu, South Korea. She has participated in a number of group art exhibitions in South Korea and Japan. In 2016 she took up photography – the camera becoming her paint brush. This globe trotting photographer is a regular contributor to Live Encounters Magazine.

Mantra of the Mandala for September
Patricia Fitzgerald

Patricia studied Visual Education and Communication at Dun Laoghaire College of Art & Design (IADT) and also holds a first class honours degree in Philosophy and Sociology from University College, Dublin. Her first book Healing Creations: Discover your mindful self through mandala colouring and journaling was published in September 2016

Prayer and Meditation
Dr Candess M Campbell

Candess M. Campbell, PhD is the author of the #1 Best-selling book on Amazon, 12 Weeks to Self-Healing: Transforming Pain through Energy Medicine and Live Intuitively; Journal the Wisdom of your Soul. She is an internationally known Author, Speaker, Intuitive Coach and Mentor and Psychik Medium. She specializes in assisting others to regain their own personal power, develop their intuition and live a life of abundance, happiness, and joy. http://energymedicinedna.com/

Cilbir
Ozlem Warren

International cooking teacher and Turkish culinary expert Ozlem Warren is a native of Turkey, lived there and extensively travelled for 30 years. She has been teaching wholesome, delicious Turkish cookery in the US, Jordan, Istanbul and England. Her recipes have been published in the local media in England, Hurriyet and Sabah national daily newspapers in Turkey. Ozlem also took part at the “Turkish Chef of the World”; “Dunyanin Tur Sefleri” TV program aired at TRT, National Turkish TV channel and in 37 countries.

© www.liveencounters.net september 2017
2017 september © www.liveencounters.net
Bimal Roy won two Filmfare hat-tricks as best director (in two spells of 3 consecutive years each), and one best picture award (a total of 8 Filmfare awards). When Bimal Roy went on stage to accept his Filmfare trophies for Do Bigha Zameen in dhoti, kurta and chappals, Bombay’s upscale film coterie raised a hue and cry. Bimal Da was only underlining his signature: simplicity and minimalism. Do Bigha Zameen won a special mention at the Cannes and Karlovy Vary film festivals (1955-56). At least 12 of his films – Udayer Pathey, Humrahi, Do Bigha Zamin, Biraj Bahu, Parineeta, Devdas, Madhumati, Usne Kaha Tha, Kabuliwalla, Sujata, Parakh and Bandini represent one of the most brilliant epochs of Indian cinema. No account of the evolution of Indian cinema can be complete without an assessment of these films. They represent the pilgrimage of a true and dedicated artist. In them can be seen the maturing from poetry to philosophy, from emotion to music.

From Udayer Pathey (1936) to Benazeer (1965), the Bimal Roy era in Indian cinema spans three decades of dedicated filmmaking. Before wielding the megaphone, Bimal Roy was cinematographer for P.V. Rao’s Nalla Thangal (Tamil), Barua’s Devdas, (Bengali, Hindi and Tamil, Manzil, Mukti and Bari Didi). He was a strong and silent human being with speech conspicuous by its absence. He was almost coerced into all sorts of associations and committees, even as he kept himself distanced from the political wrangling that formed an inevitable part of all these actions. He won awards – left, right and centre, but after some time, they did not seem to matter to him one way or another. Members of his technical crew and his acting cast won awards too, and during his time, were considered to be among the best in the industry.

From Udayer Pathey to Bandini, there are innumerable instances of screen performances and technical achievements never known to have been attained earlier. Though his background is traced back to the days when screen acting was directly influenced by the melodramatic exaggeration that marked theatrical performances, Bimal Roy was noted for his marked restraint. He evolved a subtle, normal mode, contributing to the richness of the tapestry of the realistic theme of his films. The visual brilliance of the filmmaker, apparent in his pre-directorial works like Chambe Di Kali in Punjabi and Nalla Thangal in Tamil, was mature, confident and certain. He is said to have had an almost uncanny sixth sense about the positioning of the camera. Even when an independent cameraman worked for him, he would come to the set, look through the lens, and ask for the camera to be shifted at least nine or ten times. Kamal Bose and Dilip Dutta were his regular cinematographers.

Lighting, an important element in his works, acquired greater vibrancy in Parakh, Sujata and Bandini. Whenever the narration grew nostalgic or throbbed with inner crisis, whether in anguish or in ecstasy; the mood was captured in delicate chiaroscuro patterns of black, grey and dove white. The camera was his brush and his unfailling grip over it made him manoeuvre it with gentle strokes, sweeping into his canvas the rich poetry and the powers of human beauty, the intensity and the variety of human emotions.

His narrative was unhurried, lingering, yet never tended to drag like slow-paced films usually do. The editing was marked by his characteristic spontaneity while his dialogues were always delivered in low-key and soft tones. Loudness, in other words, was conspicuous by its absence.
Pran, who played villain in *Biraj Bahu* and *Madhumati*, made more eloquent use of body language and facial expression than voice for both films. Bimal Roy perhaps, is the only filmmaker of the post-Barua-Debaki Bose era who towered over the Indian cinema scenario with such consistent command over the medium. His work is a fine blend of the sophistication of P.C. Barua, the emotional lyricism of Debaki Bose and the skilled craftsmanship of Nitin Bose.

Bimal Roy’s first directorial assignment under the NT banner was a 1000-feet government sponsored documentary on the Bengal famine of 1943. When he went on location to shoot the film, the masses turned their anger towards him, not allowing him to shoot. But he managed to win them over and got some good footage for the film. B.N. Sircar himself chose *Udayer Pathey*, an unpublished story by Jyotirmoy Roy, for Roy’s debut feature film. The film turned out to be a big commercial hit and the story came out in book form afterwards. It ran continuously for one full year at Calcutta’s Chitra Cinema. The story turned into a play and the entire dialogue was transferred onto eight discs that sold very well, creating a new way of marketing dialogue. *Udayer Pathey* introduced a new era of post-WW2 romantic-realist melodrama that was to pioneer the integration of the Bengal School style with that of Vittorio De Sica.

*Udayer Pathey* soon had a Hindi version called *Humrahi*, completely re-shot on new sets with the same artistes. However, *Humrahi* did not repeat the success of the Bengali original. His leanings towards the poor and the downtrodden perhaps came from his basic humanism rather than from purely Leftist leanings as some critics opined. His leftist leanings of any stemmed from conviction and not from active association because he never held any party ticket. Some of his political ideology is reflected in the way *Udayer Pathey’s* hero Anoop’s room. His walls were filled with portraits of national leaders and great thinkers as different as Karl Marx and Tagore. A few Tagore songs in the film became big hits. There was a fiery zeal in his earlier films, which was replaced with a mellow social concern in his later films. One of his most notable qualities was the total restraint he practiced in keeping away from any kind of political propaganda or pamphleteering in any of his films.

His next film in Calcutta for New Theatres was *Anjangarh* in Bengali and Hindi based on *Fossil*, a short story by Subodh Ghosh. This was followed by *Pehla Admi* in Hindi and *Mantra Mughda* in Bengali, based on a noted literary piece of work by Bonophool, neither of which could live up to the expectations raised in his first directorial film, *Udayer Pathey*. He also wrote Manoj Bhattacharya’s *Tathapi* in 1950. In the same year, he migrated to Bombay. He was invited by Bombay Talkies to make *Maa*, and had come to Bombay initially only for six months.

He began to receive other offers such as *Parineeta*, based on a sweet love story by Sarat Chandra and produced by Ashok Kumar with beautiful music that in time turned into a signature for every Bimal Roy film. “I consider *Parineeta* to be the most beautiful and dignified celluloid metamorphosis of an original Sarat Chandra classic that has no parallel in cinema till this day,” says journalist Shankar Lal Bhattacharya.

When he firmly established himself in Bombay, Roy decided to found his own production banner, under the name and style of Bimal Roy Productions, using as his emblem, the Rajabai Tower of Bombay University, far distanced from the more obvious and visually opulent emblems used by Raj Kapoor, Mehboob, New Theatres or Prabhat.

When he firmly established himself in Bombay, Roy decided to found his own production banner, under the name and style of Bimal Roy Productions, using as his emblem, the Rajabai Tower of Bombay University, far distanced from the more obvious and visually opulent emblems used by Raj Kapoor, Mehboob, New Theatres or Prabhat.

*Do Bigha Zamin* was the turning point. The film continues to remain the most significant film that bears the distinct stamp of the Italian neo-realism school from Bimal Roy’s films. *Do Bigha Zamin* (Two Acres of Land) was released in 1953. It is a realist drama based on a story by Salil Choudhury who loosely adapted this from a Tagore long poem of the same name. The story is about a small landowner Sambhu (Balraj Sahni) who opens with a song celebrating the rains that put an end to two seasons of drought. The song goes – *hariyala sawan dhol bajata aaya*. Sambhu and his son Kanhaiya (Ratan Kumar) have to go and work in Calcutta to repay their debt to the merciless local zamindar (Sapru) in order to retain their land.
In Calcutta, Sambhu becomes a rickshaw-puller, facing numerous hardships that lead to his near-fatal accident, the death of his wife (Nirupa Roy) and the loss of his land to speculators who build a factory on it.

Though promoted as the Indian epitome of Italian neo-realism on celluloid, in retrospect, there is more of the melodrama than neo-realism in the film. The script and the humanist acting styles, including a hard but kind landlady in the Calcutta slum and the happy-go-lucky shoeshine boy (Jagdeep) who takes Kanhaiya under his wing while humming Raj Kapoor’s “awara hoon” number all find their ancestry in Nitin Bose’s ruralist socials at New Theatres such as Desher Maati in 1938, enhanced by IPTA overtones in Salil Choudhury’s music. The film’s neo-realist reputation is almost solely based on Balraj Sahni’s extra-ordinary performance in his best-known film role. Also remarkable is Hrishikesh Mukherjee’s editing, virtually eliminating dissolves in favour of unusually hard cuts from the falling wheel of the film’s famous rickshaw race sequence to Kanhaiya coming to the bedside of his injured father. Mukherjee claims that such a cut from day to night was unprecedented in Indian cinema. Sahni however, is reported to have given a similar performance along neo-realist lines in K.A. Abbas’s first film Dharti Ke Lal (1946).

He held back the release of the completed Parineeta in favour of Do Bigha Zamin, which is said to have offended producer Ashok Kumar at the time. He set up his own sound stage and an unpretentious office at Mohan Studios in Bombay’s Andheri and went on to direct Baap Beti, Naukri and Biraj Bahu under his own banner. The films that followed are – Devdas, Madhumati, Sujata, Parakh, Yahudi, Bandini and Prem Patra. Eight more films came out of Bimal Roy Productions of which six were feature films – Amanat which Arabindo Sen was chosen to direct, Apradhi Kaun, a thriller, Parivar, a family comedy, Usne Kaha Tha based on a Premchand short story, Kabuliwalla based on a Tagore short story, and Benazeer, starring Meena Kumari. The other two were documentaries – Gotama the Buddha and Swami Vivekanand, a biographical documentary he produced for Films Division.

“Bimal-da’s work is poetry in motion,” says music director Tushar Bhatia, classifying the music in Bimal Roy’s films into four categories – (a) as a cinematographer in New Theatres Studio, Calcutta, (b) as director in New Theatres Studio, Calcutta, (c) as an independent producer-director in Mumbai with Bimal Roy Productions and (d) as freelance director with production banners other than his own. “Bimal-da’s aesthetic sensibilities were shaped and honed in New Theatres which spilled over to the films he made in Mumbai,” says Bhatia, throwing light on background sound effects and the positioning and choreography of song situations in his early films.

P.C.Barua’s Mukti was cinematographed by Bimal Roy in 1937. The film was path breaking in becoming the first ever film in history to use Tagore songs in cinema. A song from the film, “diner sheshe, ghoomer deshe” sung by Pankaj Mullick was the first Tagore song with the music composed by Mullick after obtaining clearance from Tagore himself. “The effects could be seen all over again in Salil Choudhury’s music for Bimal Roy’s Madhumati,” informs Bhatia.

In terms of literature, in terms of characterization, in terms of capturing and freezing for posterity the ethnicity of Bengal, in terms of offering a unique world-view of a silent, peaceful spirit in cinema, Bimal Roy was an institution unto himself. Bimal Roy was one of the last iconoclasts Indian cinema has ever produced. Every single film from Bimal Roy films directed by Roy himself, had a social message interwoven into the script, or, the storyline itself was chosen on the basis of its social relevance. It was also chosen for the significance of the narrative itself. Thus, we find him banking again and again on literary classics of the country. From Sarat Chandra Chattopadhyay to Munshi Premchand to Rabindranath Tagore, Roy’s films stand testimony to a celluloid transliteration of some of the immortal classics of Indian literature.

1 Lecture-demonstration at Seminar on Bimal Roy at Nehru Auditorium, Calcutta, organised by Bimal Roy Memorial Trust, in a weeklong programme in January 2002.

© Shoma A. Chatterji
Dr. Namrata Goswami is one of the foremost Indian thinkers on long-term global trends, emerging security challenges, and scenario building. Dr. Goswami is currently a Senior Analyst and Minerva Grantee. She regularly consults with Wikistrat, and is associated with NATO Partnership for Peace (PfPC) “Emerging Security Challenges” working group. She was formerly Research Fellow at the Institute for Defence Studies and Analyses (IDSA), New Delhi where she specialized on ethnic conflicts, insurgency, counter-insurgency and conflict resolution. She has been a Jennings Randolph Senior Fellow at the Congressionally Funded United States Institute of Peace (USIP) in Washington DC, where she explored long-term India-China-US scenarios in order to craft sustainable security frameworks to enable unimpeded human development and security. She was co-lead and editor of two IDSA sponsored works on long-term trends, *Imagining Asia in 2030*, and *Asia 2030 The Unfolding Future*. Her latest book published by Pentagon Press, New Delhi is on *India’s Approach to Asia, Strategy, Geopolitics and Responsibility*, 2016.

**America at Cross-Roads?**

Charlottesville shook America. On August 12, 2017, a “Unite the Right” rally was planned in this university town, basically to protest the removal of Confederate General Robert E. Lee’s statue. These protests were planned and organized by Jason Kessler, member of the “Proud Boys”, which views itself as an ultra-nationalist group. On the night of August 11, white supremacists’ groups gathered in Charlottesville shouting slogans like “white lives matter” and “blood and soil” that is historically connected to the idea of ethnicity and land. On August 12, as the rally started in Emancipation Park, some amongst the ‘Unite the Right’ protestors wore KKK imagery and Nazi paraphernalia, a militia armed with heavy weaponry was in attendance and former KKK Grand Master, David Duke attended the march. They clashed with counter-protestors especially those that call themselves the Antifa (short for anti-fascists). Antifa is not an organization but consists of those who protests fascist authoritarianism, and are mostly left-leaning. It is however important to note that not everyone protesting that day against the “Unite the Right” rally was Antifa. Some were against the idea of white-nationalism and what they interpreted as bigotry and racism. As the rally turned violent, police declared it an unlawful assembly, which led to the protestors marching through Charlottesville shouting slogans such as “one people, one nation, end immigration.”

There are many who believe that white supremacist groups like the KKK, Neo-Nazis, Proud Boys, are becoming more visible in almost all avenues of contemporary American life. According to Heidi Beirich, the Director of the Southern Poverty Law Center’s Intelligence Project, “In all of our years of tracking, we’ve never seen this many [hate] groups...We’ve never seen their ideas penetrating the mainstream the way they are. I would say most Americans don’t realize how much of this there is.” According to Matt Heimbach, a major organizer of the “Unite the Right”, white America is under growing threat, asserting that “I think, because Donald Trump’s election showed that the majority of white America’s social, working class America believes in sovereignty.” In Charlottesville, Heather Heyer, a counter-protestor, was killed when a car driven by a self-proclaimed fascist, rammed into her and several other counter-protestors. On August 27, violence broke out in a Berkeley, California rally between black clad violent left wing and Antifa protestors and peaceful right-wing protestors.
This divide and the hate with the increasing use of violent tactics to protest, are on the rise. Several argue that the election of Donald Trump as President has emboldened these ‘alt-right groups’. It is pertinent to note here that many who supported his candidacy sincerely believe that white Americans are discriminated against and are losing their cultural, if not economic, influence. Trump’s election rallies addressed and vindicated these cultural anxieties, and portrayed himself as a savior of what they viewed as the traditional American culture.

The question that arises in this context is: is America at Crossroads? What paths lay before this nation? Most importantly, what are the forces at play, that elected Donald Trump, and what does he stand for? How does one reconcile the idea of America as a “melting pot” with one dominant culture, with the idea of America as a ‘salad bowl’ with multiculturalism at its core? Significantly, unlike the popular imagination that America was founded on the principles of equality for all and a place open to immigration from across the world, the founding fathers like Thomas Jefferson, Thomas Madison, Daniel Webster, James Monroe and the author of the Star-Spangled Banner, Francis Scott Key, supported the idea of voluntary emigration of freed African-Americans in 1816 through the “American Colonization Society” or ACS, to Liberia or Haiti.

Key, supported the idea of voluntary emigration of freed African-Americans in 1816 through the “American Colonization Society” or ACS, to Liberia or Haiti. The members of ACS believed “that there is an utter aversion in the public [white majority] mind, to an amalgamation and equalization of the two races: and that any attempt to press such equalization is not only fruitless, but injurious.” The 1790 U.S. Naturalization Act limited citizenship to “free white persons” as stated “be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representatives of the United States of America, in Congress assembled, That any alien, being a free white person [emphasis added], may be admitted to become a citizen of the United States...” and this policy lasted till the mid-20th century. The Immigration Act of 1924 that debarred any immigration from Asian countries was aimed to preserve the ideals of a U.S. homogenous identity. We see outlines of those ideas coming back to the mainstream again in contemporary America.

On August 12, as the rally started in Emancipation Park, some amongst the ‘Unite the Right’ protestors wore KKK imagery and Nazi paraphernalia, a militia armed with heavy weaponry was in attendance and former KKK Grand Master, David Duke attended the march. They clashed with counter-protestors especially those that call themselves the ‘Antifa’ (short for anti-fascists). Antifa is not an organization but consists of those who protests fascist authoritarianism, and are mostly left leaning.

Globalist vs. Nationalists

The biggest chasm today is between the Globalists and the Nationalists. In an excellent piece in *The American Interest*, Jonathan Haidt describes Globalists as those who believe in a cosmopolitan world, where universal individual rights are paramount, where international borders are irrelevant, and where progress and change are cherished values. Globalists, are usually financially secure, have moved away from ‘survival needs’ and the need to protect ones’ own tribe and family to emancipatory values that celebrate a cosmopolitan attitude, connected to a world humanist spirit. They look down on parochial attitudes, and view everyone as ‘fellow citizens of the world’. They are usually in favor of immigration and multiculturalism. Globalists sees themselves as citizens of the world, and that national benefits should be extended to all people and not just citizens.

The Nationalists, on the other hand, see national benefits as extended to an exclusive club, where allegiance and adherence to traditional values, has an entrance fee. Nationalist cherish love of country and the need to preserve a preferred normative way of life. They prioritize a shared sense of identity and history and firmly believe that their government has a duty to protect and preserve them. To be sure, some Nationalists espouse racist beliefs that their race or country is the best, but not all Nationalists harbor such bigotry or beliefs. For the most part, Nationalists firmly believe that citizens should be the priority for their governments. In his speech in the rally at Phoenix, Arizona, on August 22, 2017, President Trump reiterated what Nationalists cherish when he said, “we reaffirm our shared customs, traditions and values. We love our country. We celebrate our troops. We embrace our freedom. We respect our flag. We are proud of our history. We cherish our Constitution, including, by the way, the Second Amendment”. He went on to state that he is for those struggling Americans that are left behind and forgotten and that the government will take care of them, “So to Americans young and old, near and far, in cities small and large, we say these words again tonight: We will make America strong again. We will make America wealthy again. We will make America proud again. We will make America safe again. And we will make America great again”. So, his words are basically a communication to the Nationalists that their country is in safe hands. Trump wants to appear strong on immigration and the wall as most Nationalists believe uncontrolled immigration are chipping away at their way of life. Mind you, the Nationalists believe that moderated immigration from countries with similar value systems are welcome as those folks assimilate and cherish the American way of life, but unchecked immigration from places with a different value system will wreak havoc on American culture, especially dominated by Anglo-Saxon values, the Protestant work ethic and the English language.
For instance, Nationalists view Islam with its personal laws, as an affront on American values and fear that with the growth of Muslim populations in America, their personal laws to include marriage, divorce, separate facilities for women and body-veiling, will penetrate into American culture. Trump, in a speech in Washington, in April 2016 stated, "We will no longer surrender this country or its people to the false song of globalism." On August 25, 2017, Trump pardoned former Arizona Sheriff, Joe Arpaio, found guilty of using illegal tactics to go after undocumented immigrants. The White House, in a statement, stated "throughout his time as sheriff, Arpaio continued his life's work of protecting the public from the scourges of crime and illegal immigration." In this, Trump's attempt is to lock in his Nationalist supporters to his presidency.

Individual Vs. Group Rights

The U.S. Constitution stands for individual rights and liberties. The Bill of Rights moved by James Madison in 1791, ensures freedom of speech, press, religion, the right to bear arms, etc. The ten amendments are the essence of American individual rights. The U.S. Declaration of Independence states that individuals are at liberty to pursue happiness and life goals without the interference of others. Most Americans are uncomfortable with the assertion of group rights and identities, vis-à-vis a citizen's individual rights. For instance, the famous American author, Ayn Rand, stated "the mind is an attribute of the individual. There is no such thing as a collective brain. There is no such thing as a collective thought." Best captured in this description, "individualism regards man—every man—as an independent, sovereign entity who possesses an inalienable right to his own life, a right derived from his nature as a rational being. Individualism holds that a civilized society, or any form of association, cooperation or peaceful coexistence among men, can be achieved only on the basis of the recognition of individual rights—and that a group, as such, has no rights other than the individual rights of its members." President Trump is a fan of Ayn Rand stating that her book The Fountainhead, "relates to business (and) beauty (and) life and inner emotions. That book relates to...everything". Trump identified with Howard Roark, the main character in the book who stood for fighting against all odds to accomplish his idealistic goals. Trump asserted that the tyranny of group think is what is a bane in the contemporary United States.

Group rights that metamorphoses into group identity and politics is viewed as muddying the paramount individual loyalty to these United States especially by Nationalists. Consequently, such group-based identities as Asian-American, African-American, Native-American, Jewish-American, Muslim-American, Hindu-American, are viewed as adverse to the idea of being simply an American, which is the only identity that should matter. While some may view this perspective as disrespectful to the histories of African Americans or Native Americans, the politicization of group identities and then utilizing that for social, economic and political gains are viewed as anti-American by Nationalists. Hence, the fear expressed by Nationalists and Trump supporters towards Muslim immigration, who they judge as holding strongly formed group identities where adherence to Islam negates all other loyalties. These Nationalist fears are bolstered by the narratives of the terrorist groups like ISIS who propagate an Islamic Ummah (one nation) and Caliphate by violent means that transcends all kinds of states identities and borders.

Nativists Vs. Cosmopolitan Values

Nativists vs. Cosmopolitan values is continuing the Globalist vs. Nationalist chasm that was described earlier. Nativists (an American term, first used in the mid-19th century to describe native born Protestants vis-à-vis Catholic immigrants), are ethno-centric ultra-nationalists, who view themselves as original settlers of the country and want to preserve their "demographic predominance in that territory." Nativists value America First, that America is for Americans, and that the rights of natural born Americans are higher than immigrants. Trump's Presidential Inaugural speech of "America First", in which he categorically states, "we assembled here today are issuing a new decree to be heard in every city, in every foreign capital, and in every hall of power. From this day forward, a new vision will govern our land. From this moment on, it’s going to be America First", reaches out to the Nativists. Reviving the European culture of the U.S., viewed as the native culture, and closed borders are advocated by Nativists. Nativism is opposed to immigration in the belief that immigrants will destroy existing cultural belief systems. There is also the religious belief in the "the Protestant Ethic", and the fear that illegal immigration threatens a common language (English), as well as the work ethic, and the law (a unified legal framework). Immigration from diverse cultures are viewed as constituting threats to sexual norms regarding women's dress and freedom. And it critically threatens economic opportunities. Like Nationalists, Nativists believe in the "melting pot" of one American culture, whereas the left is associated with the "salad bowl" of multiculturalism - cosmopolitanism, concerned with symbols that convey a tolerance of diversity or opposition to state sponsorship of anti-cosmopolitanism values. They seek to remove from celebration any national monuments with an association with minorities or slavery, and that contrasts with a Nativist, who views these as part of American culture. A Nativist does not favor the white-washing of history to remove their importance or positive contribution for some symbolic ends. Nativists also fear the slippery slope; where does it end?
Do we tear down Monticello, the home of Thomas Jefferson, a slave owner, or the White House, built by slaves? Difference between Cosmopolitanism and Nativists are that Nativists, not unlike Nationalists, believe that America does have a real moral claim to its past contributions and purpose whereas Cosmopolitanism is more likely to deny an ‘American exceptionalism’ and to be skeptical of America’s moral record and purpose, focusing instead on its shortcomings. Nationalists and Nativists alike consider it a great affront if individuals in American society do not wish to pledge allegiance, take military service or honor the flag and honor those that do. Cosmopolitans may be tolerant or encouraging of believing that Nationalism is an unnecessary source of division and conflict in the world.

Where does Donald Trump Stand?

President Donald Trump had famously quipped, “hey, I’m a nationalist and a globalist...I’m both”. Hence, one cannot be too sure where his ideological leanings are though one can safely predict that he likes being unpredictable. That said, President Trump will never lose sight of his base, the voters that made him President, despite opposition to his candidacy from within his own Republican elites. We cannot forget that several top Republican national security officials signed a letter against his candidacy. It is his stance on immigration, calling out Islamic terrorism, building the wall, and ‘America first’ slogans that locked in his base to his candidacy. His recent barring of transgender military service or honor the flag and honor those that do. Cosmopolitans may be tolerant or encouraging of believing that Nationalism is an unnecessary source of division and conflict in the world.

End Notes

3 Nelson and Lind, n.1.
8 Ibid.

All views expressed in this article are solely that of the author.


17 Ibid.

18 Ibid.

19 Ibid.


22 See Samuel Huntington, Who are We?: The Challenges to America’s National Identity (New York: Simon & Schust), 2004. Huntington argues that culture is about “a people’s language, religious beliefs, social and political values, assumptions as to what is right and wrong, appropriate and inappropriate...and...the objective institutions and behavioral patterns that these subjective elements”, pp. 30-31.

23 Conversations with an American political analyst on American nationalism, n.20.


28 Ibid.


Dr. Bibhu Prasad Routray, Director www.mantraya.org

THE ‘AL QAEDA’ STREAM OF KASHMIR MILITANCY

Abstract

A segment within the Kashmir militancy has turned global. Declaring itself a branch of the al Qaeda, this small team of militants are not just posing new challenges to the Indian security establishment, but also to the Pakistan sponsored movement which aims at merger with Pakistan as Kashmir’s end objective.

Today, anti-Indian dissent in Kashmir is partly indigenous, partly Pakistan sponsored, and a small part of it is radicalised and global, envisioning Kashmir’s future being a part of an Islamic caliphate. The protracted history of Pakistan-sponsored militancy’s attempts to usurp the indigenous movement is being challenged by the newly established third stream that seeks to convert the separatist militancy into a transcendental religious mission with a pan-Islamist goal. Apart from being a part of the large issue of militancy that New Delhi must tackle to stabilise Kashmir, this third stream pose an existential challenge to the pro-Pakistan separatists and militants. In fact, its growth can derail both the moralistic indigenous movement which attempts to highlight the alienation among the Kashmiris as a raison d’etre for the demand of independence and the Pakistan sponsored separatist struggle that uses a huge array of instruments of violence to outmanoeuvre New Delhi.

In the pipeline

The thought process behind the third stream, which intends Kashmir to be a part of the global Islamic caliphate, has been evolving through small innocuous acts like incidents of waving of the flag of the Islamic State, since 2015. While the government, the separatists, and the strategic community dismissed those incidents as inconsequential, such aspirations have quietly grown to nurture a small band of followers. Despondent with the directions of militancy and its rather gloomy objective of making Kashmir a part of Pakistan, this new stream of militancy aims at providing a new lease of life to the struggle for independence, although the prospects of its success are as hopeless as the movement supported by the Pakistani agencies. Hizbul Mujahideen (HM) commander Zakir Rashid Bhat alias Zakir Musa was the first to renounce merger with Pakistan as the objective of the Kashmiris. In May 2017 he declared, “Our intention should be that, we have to achieve azadi (freedom) to establish Islamic rule and not for secular state. If we are fighting for secular state then my blood won’t be spilled for that purpose.” he said. Subsequently he threatened to publicly behead Hurriyat leaders, who insist that the movement is Kashmir is “political”.

His expulsion from HM notwithstanding, such declaration and public repudiation of the stand by the Pakistan based militant leadership and the separatist Hurriyat formalised the founding of the third stream of militancy in Kashmir. Musa went on to announce the arrival of the al Qaeda in Kashmir and appeared in a video in May 2017 under the al-Qaeda banner, “accusing Indian Muslims of cowardice, and calling on them to engage in jihad against the government”. In the last week of July, the al-Qaeda in the Indian subcontinent’s new affiliate for Kashmir, Ansar Ghazwat-ul-Hind, designated Musa as its chief. Among many of the quiet developments that are constantly taking place in the militancy landscape in the state, Abu Dujana, the Lashkar-e-Toiba (LeT) commander in South Kashmir, too had opted to be a part of the process that resents the corrupt LeT and HM leadership and their close association with the Pakistani state. Dujana’s personal and occupational feud with the LeT leadership may have precipitated his decision. The fact, however, is that the externally sponsored militancy which has tried its best to remain monolithic is facing an existential challenge from Musa and co.

The ‘trap’ of Ansar Ghazwat-ul-Hind

“Do not fall into the trap of Ansar Ghazwat-ul-Hind”, warned Raiyaz Naikoo, commander of the HM, at the funeral of two militants in South Kashmir’s Tahab in the last week of July 2017. He rejected the call given by Zakir Musa and the arrival of al Qaeda in Kashmir: “Linking our struggle with Al-Qaeda and ISIS is a strategy to defame our struggle,” he said. “Pakistan flag is our flag,” said Naikoo in his speech.
The fact that Abu Dujana and Arif Lehhari had switched sides to join the al Qaeda and an announcement to that effect was in the offing was confirmed by Musa and endorsed by a video statement by al Qaeda’s present chief Ayman al Zawahiri. “When Dujana understood the right path and joined our ranks, there were some self-styled leaders of jihad in Pakistan who caused many difficulties in their way. Martyr Arif, also had to go through a number of difficulties, but they both fought till their last breath in the way of Allah”, Musa said. Musa’s growing stature and the line he toes makes him a thorn in the flesh for the LeT and/or the HM.

Zakir Musa is real

The propaganda that al Qaeda in Kashmir is unreal and is a mere creation of Indian agencies would have gone unchallenged without Zakir Musa, who continues to lead a mini revolution of sorts to emphasise the importance of a pan Islamism emanating militant movement and disown any attempt to limit the end game to merely merging Kashmir’s future with Pakistan. Musa’s support base may not be spectacular. According to a police official, his group “consists of perhaps half-a-dozen people, with few arms and sources of funding. He’s pretty much a dead man walking.” But on occasions he has managed to attract enough attention to trouble the separatists and the Pakistan based terrorists. Musa’s denunciation of Pakistan and his campaign against hoisting its flag during militant funerals in some parts of the valley including Srinagar has borne fruit on few occasions. On 19 July, group of youths tossed away the Pakistan flag during the funeral of Sajad Gilkar, a militant from downtown Srinagar and wrapped the body with a flag resembling that of the Islamic State. According to a report, hundreds of people defied curfew and gathered at Nowhatta for Gilkar’s funeral where they endorsed Bhat’s call.

The fact that Abu Dujana and Arif Lehhari had switched sides to join the al Qaeda and an announcement to that effect was in the offing, was confirmed by Musa and endorsed by a video statement by al Qaeda’s present chief Ayman al Zawahiri. “When Dujana understood the right path and joined our ranks, there were some self-styled leaders of jihad in Pakistan who caused many difficulties in their way. Martyr Arif, also had to go through a number of difficulties, but they both fought till their last breath in the way of Allah”, Musa said. Musa’s growing stature and the line he toes makes him a thorn in the flesh for the LeT and/or the HM.

Counter Insurgency Successes

In the first week of June 2017, the Indian Army released a list of 12 most dreaded terrorists active in the Kashmir Valley. The list included LeT’s Abu Dujana, HM’s Riyaz Naikoo and Zakir Musa. Till the time of writing of this piece, five of these 12 had already been killed in separate encounters. More than 120 terrorists had been killed this year, the highest in the last seven years. Although killing of terrorists alone may not finish militancy, New Delhi believes that making the militant movement headless, even for a while, will allow it the opportunity to undertake other measures. Less militancy would necessarily mean fewer encounters and less dead bodies of militants for the public to rally around.

Reports have indicated that the security forces would continue pursuing a hardline approach on militancy in Kashmir. High-value terrorists like Zakir Musa and LeT’s Abu Ismail would remain primary targets. Abu Ismail (who interestingly did not figure in the list of 12 most wanted terrorists released in June 2017) is believed to be the mastermind behind the 10 July 2017 attack on the pilgrims of the Amarnath Yatra and is the new Kashmir division chief of LeT. Reports have indicated that the security forces would continue pursuing a hardline approach on militancy in Kashmir. High-value terrorists like Zakir Musa and LeT’s Abu Ismail would remain primary targets. Abu Ismail (who interestingly did not figure in the list of 12 most wanted terrorists released in June 2017) is believed to be the mastermind behind the 10 July 2017 attack on the pilgrims of the Amarnath Yatra and is the new Kashmir division chief of LeT.

On 9 August a brief afternoon operation by the security forces led to the killing of three militants affiliated to Zakir Musa-led Ansar Ghazwat-ul Hind in Tral area of south Kashmir’s Pulwama district. From a counterinsurgency perspective, however, keeping Zakir Musa alive, at least for the time being, would make sense. While his minimal contribution to the level of militancy would not bother the security establishment, his repeated statements vowing for an Islamic Kashmir and his ability to split and weaken the Pakistani sponsored militancy could be of some use to the security forces.
An Open Letter from Families and Supporters of America's Arunachal Missing in Action to Prime Minister Narendra Modi and President Donald Trump: Time to Bring Home America's 400 Missing in Action Servicemen from India

Dear Prime Minister Modi and President Trump,

According to the US Defense Department, the bodies of an estimated 400 American military airmen killed in air crashes in northeast India during World War II still lie unrecovered at their crash sites in remote parts of the Indian Himalayas. You need to know their names, for you, as the leaders of the two countries most directly involved in this little-known humanitarian problem, are ultimately responsible for the fact that their families are still waiting for their bodies to be returned to them. Men like 1st Lt. Irwin “Zipper” Zaetz, Flight Officer Sheldon “Shel” Chambers, SSgt. Louis F. Verhaegen, Captain John L. “Blackie” Porter, and SSgt. Charles D. “Buck” Ginn are only a few of these 400 who made the ultimate sacrifice, and whose remains still lie unburied far from home.

For the families of these heroic men, killed while flying supplies to China to aid the Chinese war effort against Japan, this situation has become intolerable. International law recognizes their right to know the fate of their loved ones, and their right to receive their loved ones' remains for proper burial. As the International Committee of the Red Cross has pointed out, "Everyone has a right to know about the fate of his/her missing relative(s), including their whereabouts or, if dead, the circumstances of their death and place of burial if known, and to receive mortal remains." But many close relatives of these men have died in recent years, knowing that their loved ones' crash sites had been definitively located, but that little or no efforts have been made by the Governments of India and the US to honor this right. More close relatives of these men are reaching the age where they fear that they, too, will die without their right to bury their relatives’ remains being honored.

Gary Zaetz is the founder and chairman of the US-based advocacy group Families and Supporters of America's Arunachal Missing in Action, founded to press the Indian and US Governments to permit recovery operations for the remains of 400 missing in action US servicemen killed in air crashes in Arunachal Pradesh during World War II. He trekked to his uncle's crash site in the mountains of Arunachal in 2008. He earned a master's degree in political science from Massachusetts Institute of Technology in 1978.
Here are the facts of this troubling situation:

1. In December 2009, after initially permitting the first US Government recovery team into India in more than 30 years, to recover human remains from the crash site of the B-24 “Hot as Hell,” the Government of India expelled that team before any remains could be recovered. The Indian Government never gave the eight families of this crew any credible explanation for the expulsion. Not only did the Administration of President Barack Obama fail to file a formal diplomatic protest against this expulsion, it refused to even mildly criticize it.

2. From January 2010 - September 2015, the Government of India did not permit any US government recovery teams into the northeast Indian state of Arunachal Pradesh, where the vast majority of these crashes occurred, despite repeated requests for permission by the US Government. This de facto moratorium had no legal basis under the Geneva Conventions. Your Government, Prime Minister Modi, has never apologized for the psychological pain and suffering this moratorium inflicted on the US families of airmen killed in Arunachal Pradesh during World War II. Nor has your Government apologized for its denial of their legal rights to their relatives’ remains. Alarmingly, your Government has also refused to pledge that such a moratorium will never again be imposed. The Obama Administration, following pattern, never filed a diplomatic protest against this moratorium; nor did it publicly criticize it at any time.

3. In September 2015, your Government, Prime Minister Modi, finally relaxed this moratorium by permitting a Defense Department recovery team to return to the “Hot as Hell” crash site. But your party, the BJP, was in office for well over a year before permitting this relaxation to occur. And during that entire time, your Government never once criticized the previous Government of Prime Minister Manmohan Singh for imposing this moratorium; nor did it publicly criticize it at any time.

4. In each of the years 2015 and 2016, despite the fact that there are at least 15 documented US crash sites in Arunachal Pradesh, the Government of India permitted only one crash site in the entire territory of India to be investigated for the mortal remains of US airmen. This arbitrary restriction is also a violation of the Geneva Conventions.

5. In April 2016, when an official ceremony for the turnover of remains recovered in late 2015 was held at an airbase in New Delhi, no senior Indian civilian or military officials were present, despite the fact that US Secretary of Defense Ash Carter was present; nor was there an Indian military honor guard present. These absences reflect the very low priority the Indian Government attaches to these recoveries. They also represent a violation by the Indian Government of traditional military repatriation protocol, protocol adhered to by many other Governments.

6. During calendar year 2017, the Government of India has refused permission for recovery operations anywhere in India. We have searched all Indian Government public websites and failed to find any announcement of permission for 2017. From what we can tell, contrary to a statement made earlier this year by Brig. Ravi Murugan, India’s Defence Attache in Washington, to Gary Zaetz, leader of the group Families and Supporters of America’s Arunachal MIAs, US-India cooperation on MIA recoveries during the year 2017 is not a “matter of record.”

7. President Trump, since your Administration took office, no official of yours has ever criticized the previous Obama Administration for its lack of pressure on the Indian Government to cooperate more fully with US recovery efforts. Nor has any official of yours criticized the Indian Government for its lack of full cooperation with such efforts.

8. President Trump, on 27 July 2017, the Indian media reported that Secretary of State Tillerson and Secretary of Defense Mattis submitted a joint report to Congress on the Trump Administration’s relations with the Government of Prime Minister Modi. Among the areas discussed in this report was US-India cooperation to recover hundreds of US war dead from World War II crash sites in India: “The United States and India continue to work together to locate, identify, recover, and honorably repatriate the remains of approximately 400 unaccounted-for US service members from World War II.” Unfortunately, President Trump, there is no evidence to support this statement. Official reports released by the Defense Department’s Defense POW/MIA Accounting Agency on its global recovery efforts for 2017 have not mentioned any efforts to date in India, and its reports on future recovery activities this year omit any mention of India as well. The Tillerson-Mattis statement appears to be merely public relations boilerplate intended to placate both the Congress and the families of the missing, and mislead them into thinking that real cooperation during 2017 is ongoing.

9. The Government of India, from reading the communications we have received from it over the last decade, clearly fails to understand that, under the Geneva Conventions, associated Protocols, and customary international humanitarian law, the PRIMARY responsibility for the recovery of missing in action servicemen lies with the government of the country of the suspected locations of remains, not with the government of the country of the missing servicemen.

© Gary Zaetz
Consequently, India, as host country, bears primary responsibility for this intolerable humanitarian situation. Even if the US Government decided it could not send a recovery team of its own, or was prevented from doing so by India, it is the legal responsibility of the Indian Government on its own to make sure that the remains are recovered as quickly as possible, and turned over to US authorities. In 2011, Col. H. Wayne Elliott, US Army (Ret’d), Former Head of the International Law Department, Judge Advocate General School, made a number of observations, in his Crimes of War article entitled “Dead and Wounded”, that, when applied to the Indian Government’s moratorium on US war dead recoveries in Arunachal, amount to a scathing indictment of the Indian Government for violations of the laws of war regarding recovery of US war dead. Among his observations was this one: “...if the dead are left on the battlefield for some time after the fighting has ended, their very presence is evidence of failure to meet the obligations imposed by law...” (http://pegasus.law.columbia.edu/record=b719714)

10. President Trump, even one of India's most outspoken Congressional advocates has felt compelled to publicly criticize India’s poor level of cooperation with US efforts to recover its war dead. On 13 June 2017 Congressman George Holding, co-chairman of the Congressional Caucus on India and Indian-Americans, gave a speech entitled “U.S. WWII MIA RECOVERY OPERATIONS IN INDIA.” In this speech, made on the floor of the House of Representatives, he assessed India’s record of MIA cooperation and gave it a mediocre grade: ”To this day Mr. Speaker, U.S. airmen remain unrecovered and unburied. Efforts to locate and document these crash sites have been intermittently undertaken by both private citizens and the U.S. Department of Defense...the tempo of recovery operations could be categorized as slow at best for a variety of reasons, leaving the families of the deceased without closure...Unfortunately Mr. Speaker, the single largest impediment to these recovery operations came when the Government of India placed a de facto moratorium on operations in Arunachal Pradesh for the vast majority of 2010 until 2015...As co-chair of the Congressional Caucus on India and Indian-Americans, I urge the Governments of the United States and India to increase their collaboration and accelerate the recovery of these remains. The families of those lost during World War II deserve closure. We need to bring our airmen home.”

11. Despite the fact that the US Government initially discussed initiation of MIA recoveries with the Government of India in 2004, the remains of only one US airman has been positively confirmed to be recovered by US Government recovery teams from 2004-2017, a period of 13 years! During this time, the families of missing American airmen in India have been irreparably harmed by this failure of cooperation: a number of relatives of these men died knowing that their relatives’ crash sites had been identified but before their right to bury their relatives’ remains could be honored. These relatives were Dr. Stephen L. Chambers, Ethyle Renee Wolfe, Frances E. Lenox, Theopa Christine Owens Sheen, Forrest T. Riley, Jr., Susan Brown Parham, Fred Morris Oxford, Helen Patricia Campanaro, Ulysses Franklin Coler, Jr., Edwin Grant Dewsnup, Suzanne Emma Maupin Johnson, Muriel E. Clare, Robert J. Frazier, Anna Catherine Swanson, Dorothy Mae Brizzi, William Verhaegen, Dale George Catalano, and Gladys Mohn Terry. This year, the sister of one of these airmen - Verna Chambers Martin - is reaching the age of 100, and, given the fact that the Pentagon tells us that it has abandoned his well-documented India crash site, she fears that she will be dead before she can bury her brother’s body.

Families and Supporters of America’s Arunachal Missing in Action seek the immediate implementation by the Indian and US Governments of this 12-point action plan intended to institutionalize and significantly accelerate the recovery of our MIAs from India:

(1) Clarification as to whether DoD plans any recovery operations anywhere in India during the entire of the calendar year 2017. At the present time, open-source documents indicate that no such operations are planned for 2017. If that is indeed the case, that would signify a breach of faith on the part of the Modi Government.

(2) A public commitment by the Indian Government to permitting multiple concurrent US recovery operations at crash sites in Arunachal Pradesh every year from now until all known US crash sites are fully recovered, no later than the end of Fiscal Year 2022. Up to the present time, the Indian Government has only permitted one crash site to be investigated in the entire territory of India during any given year. At that rate, it will be 2030 before the US crash sites documented at the present time will be investigated, long after the death of any close relatives of the servicemen known to have died at those crash sites. That rate of recovery operations is absolutely unacceptable.

(3) A public commitment by the Indian Government to permitting each recovery operation to continue until forensic anthropologists have confirmed that the entire physical area of the recovery operation has been exhaustively searched.

(4) A public apology by the Government of India for the 5-year-long (2010-2015) moratorium on MIA recovery operations in Arunachal Pradesh. This public apology must include explicit recognition that this moratorium violated the internationally recognized legal rights of the families to the remains of their loved ones, and that it also caused great psychological pain and suffering to these families.

© Gary Zaetz
(5) A public commitment by the Government of India never to impose such a moratorium again, with exceptions allowed only for the outbreak of international hostilities in the immediate area of a recovery operation, or a serious natural disaster in the immediate area of a recovery operation.

(6) A public recognition by the Indian Government that, under international law, it bears primary responsibility for the recovery of missing in action servicemen on its national territory. Together with this recognition, the Indian Government must commit to complete recovery operations on its own by the end of Fiscal Year 2022 if the US Government is unable to do so.

(7) Finalization of points (2)-(6) above in the form of a formal, signed Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) between the US Defense and State Departments, on the one hand, and the Indian Ministry of Defence, Indian Ministry of External Affairs, and Indian Ministry of Home Affairs, on the other.

(8) In view of the fact that the B-24 Hot as Hell (MACR 2140) crash site had been visited by DPAA/JPAC teams on three separate occasions (late 2008, early 2009, and late 2009) without the Defense Department ever mentioning a terrain instability issue during those separate occasions (with that consideration being cited by DoD as the main reason for discontinuing recovery operations only during the fourth visit, in late 2015), we seek a commitment from the Defense Department to return to that crash site prior to the end of Fiscal Year 2018 to recover the remains of the 7 unrecovered members of the 8-man crew.

(9) In the event that DPAA lacks sufficient manpower of its own to mount multiple concurrent operations in India every year, we seek a DPAA commitment to contracting recovery operations with a private MIA recovery organization, giving priority to an organization which can demonstrate that it has successfully conducted recovery operations in India in the past.

(10) An official statement by the Government of the People’s Republic of China that it has no objection whatsoever to the unconditional resumption of US Government MIA recoveries anywhere in the disputed territory of Arunachal Pradesh. The US and Indian Governments must take the initiative to persuade the Government of the PRC to make this statement.

(11) Passage by the Congress of a Sense of the Congress resolution expressing the Sense of the Congress that (a) the level of cooperation on the part of the Government of India with US efforts to recover our war dead has been unsatisfactory, and (b) that the Trump Administration must serve a formal diplomatic protest with the Government of India over the Indian Government’s long record of either nonexistent or minimal cooperation.

(12) Public announcement by the Trump White House that the level of cooperation on the part of the Government of India with US efforts to recover our war dead has been unsatisfactory, and must be significantly enhanced.

Sincerely,

Gary Zaetz
Nephew of Arunachal MIA 1st Lt. Irwin Zaetz, who, as navigator of the lost B-24 Liberator “Hot as Hell”, has been missing in action in India since 25 January 1944
Founder and Chairman, Families and Supporters of America’s Arunachal Missing in Action
Cary, North Carolina
The Holy Relics of St. Francis Xavier in a silver casket, Basilica of Bom Jesus, Old Goa.

Photograph by Mark Ulyseas.


www.amazon.com

Mr. Parrikar, Who will guard the guards themselves?
– A letter from Mark Ulyseas

Congratulations on winning the Panaji bypoll seat. Now begins the real business of running the smallest state with the biggest heart - send a message to all Goa is not for sale!

Goa CM Manohar Parrikar …
Quis custodiet ipsos custodes?

Goa to many foreign and Indian tourists means fabulous beaches, great food and hospitality plus the added attraction of drugs, parties and prostitution. The impression these folk have is that anything goes in Goa – sex, drugs and parties. Of course prostitution and paedophilia are the fringe attractions. This warped perception of Goa can perhaps be an inconvenient inheritance from the hippie days – sex, drugs and rock n roll (whatever this means). Sucessive governments have failed miserably to counter this. In fact this has been exacerbated by political corruption.

The Goan people, religious and in many ways conservative, have had their environs occupied and contaminated by ‘westerners’ hell bent on creating their own little businesses that can’t stand up to close scrutiny but somehow manage to carry on regardless with the connivance of some people/officials. In addition to the state government losing crores of rupees due to tax evasion, it also poses a tangible security threat – possible infiltration of terrorist networks.

Mr. Parrikar, when you returned to Goa from a stint as the Defence Minister of India you stated that – the Maratha warrior king Chhatrapati Shivaji Maharaj is your political guru and that you would like to imbibe at least some of his qualities. So what better way to do this than to act firmly in favour of preserving the rich cultural heritage of Goa? (Without of course infringing on the fundamental rights of the citizens of India to live and work anywhere in the country).
I recall a resident commenting, "If you have a problem brother, don’t go to the police. And if you see anyone buying or selling drugs walk away. Don’t talk about it. Otherwise you will get 'bamboo massage' (severely beaten by persons unknown).

There are thousands of honest, hardworking government officials and others including religious leaders and organisations (Christian and Hindu) whose good work is negated by reports of drug arrests by a breathless media that is known to only focus on the dark side of Goa instead of highlighting the positive aspects of its vibrant ethos. Support these hardworking folk for they represent the heart of Goa, a state that is, for me, a fabulous jewel.

When I read this news report about the recent arrests of owners and some guests of two popular beach shacks in Anjuna on drug charges I couldn’t help but wonder how such drug activities continue in Goa under the watchful eye of the guardians of the law? Are you aware that a police station is a short distance from the two popular beach shacks? Are you also aware that many locals are too afraid to speak out for fear of being gunned down or stabbed or falsely implicated by persons unknown?

I recall a resident commenting - "If you have a problem brother, don’t go to the police. And if you see anyone buying or selling drugs walk away. Don’t talk about it. Otherwise you will get 'bamboo massage' (severely beaten by persons unknown) or sometimes falsely implicated by the police."

This is reflective of the deep distrust the locals have for the police. And why is this so? Perhaps it could be the omissions and commissions of the local administration? For how could it be that the police from Maharashtra regularly raid, beat and arrest drug users and peddlers in Goa and then drag them back to Mumbai? And how come the Enforcement from New Delhi makes regular successful forays into Goa? And what about the arrests made by the Kerala Police in Goa?

Here are a few observations:

1. The war on drugs begins with the local politician, local police and the panchayat. It is evident that somewhere between these three the system is rotten. Banning parties or music concerts does not stop drug activities. Further, such knee jerk action negatively impacts local businesses. Drug trade and terrorism are two sides of the same coin. So combating the drug problem also ensures enhanced security for the state.

2. Corruption in India is as natural as breathing. Goa is no exception. This leads to a system that encourages drugs. Clamping down on corruption by summarily sacking corrupt officials including police personnel and publicly naming and shaming corrupt politicians are the first steps to combating this problem.

3. Drug trade and terrorism are two sides of the same coin. So combating the drug problem also ensures enhanced security for the state. But drug trade is not the only problem:

- Prostitution is rampant. One can find an array of nationalities on offer with prices ranging from a few hundred rupees to tens of thousands. White men, women and children are in great demand. It is claimed that preferences are rising for the under age.

- It is claimed that foreigners overstaying in Goa often get help to ‘illegally’ extend their visas with the help of certain officials.

- It is claimed that some beach ‘hawkers’ and small shops run by people from out of state (Karnataka, Kashmir etc.) are involved in drug peddling. There is no proper system to monitor their activities. Kashmiris have been caught in drug busts. It is not a secret that some of the major routes of the drug trade originate from Punjab, Kashmir and Himachal Pradesh. However, this doesn’t imply that all outsiders are involved in the drug trade or other illegal businesses. Indians have a right to work anywhere in the country.

- Foreign owned Indian local businesses: There are a number of ‘foreign owned’ Indian businesses in Goa. Some people act as a front for the foreign investor. Cash generated from retail sales is rarely accounted for. So where does the money go? It is said that many of these illegal businesses owned by westerners are ‘reserved’ for their own kind. Tax evasion is the rule rather than the exception.

- The menace of stray cattle is rising. They can be seen grazing at the local garbage dump along with goats and dogs. Cows are often the cause of fatal road accidents. Perhaps it is time to get the cows off the streets. Garbage disposal is what it is - throw garbage anywhere and everywhere.

- The battle between development and environmental damage rages on.

- With the unchecked massive influx of out of state investors the Goans are being side lined. Very soon you will have to change the name of Goa, the smallest state in India, to something else. Perhaps it will become a colony, again, of some western country or swallowed up by Maharashtra or Karnataka or Kerala. The Goan identity is facing an existential crisis.
Goans need security, accountability of politicians and government officials, assistance for small farmers and businesses, improved educational and medical facilities, preservation of the beach areas, sewage and garbage disposal, cessation of illegal mining etc.

Mr Parrikar you had said on your return to Goa - "The pressure of the issues like Kashmir while working as defence minister in Delhi was one of the reasons why I chose to come back to Goa." Now that you have returned claiming you are the Guardian of Goa please honour your responsibility.

There is no magic formula to change Goa overnight but this is your fourth stint as CM of the state and you have no excuse not to act decisively. What you do Mr. Parrikar must be seen, heard and felt by the wonderful people of Goa and all those across India and the world who love and cherish this beautiful state.

Om Shanti Shanti Shanti Om

Some Indian and Foreign media reports.

https://www.heraldgoa.in/Goa/North-Goa/After-Lamanis-now-foreigners-follow-suit-at-Arambol-beach/113382.html
http://www.navhindtimes.in/unchecked-corruption-in-goas-panchayats/

Foreign owned Indian local businesses: There a number of ‘foreign owned’ Indian businesses in Goa. Some people act as a front for the foreign investor. Cash generated from retail sales is rarely accounted for. So where does the money go? It is said that many of these illegal businesses owned by westerners are ‘reserved’ for their own kind. Tax evasion is the rule rather than the exception.

Goa’s police informer turns out to be biggest drug supplier for Kerala
http://englishnews.thegoan.net/story.php?id=35700


http://www.dailymail.co.uk/wires/afp/article-4558206/Families-demand-India-probe-Goa-tourist-murders.html
http://www.reddit.com/r/india/comments/5zmhgg/got_caught_with_weed_in_goa_today/

http://www.thehindu.com/news/states/man-held-for-desecration-of-was-brainwashed-by-iranian-jail-mates-goan-cm/article19310283.ece
http://www.express.co.uk/news/world/724055/Prostitution-Goa-idyllic-holiday-destination-sex-traffic-HELL-India-prostitution

https://www.theguardian.com/world/2014/jan/07/goa-india-drugs-trade-gangs
Yogyakarta is a thriving town in Central Java and one of the most iconic places in Indonesia. Like many other places in Indonesia it is changing fast as businesses and industry grow and beautiful batiks and floral headwraps give way to the dun coloured jilbabs and drab dresses. But the creative spirit stays strong and the arts scene is thriving.

Art and artists grow in the warm and fecund atmosphere with many galleries holding exhibitions of cutting edge style.

Yet, behind the fast growing exuberance is an older more spiritual and traditional layer; the synceticy of old Java. Step inside the hallowed grounds of the historic Sultan’s palace - the Kraton and you will experience a different, more stately world. Pass through the ten foot thick, white walls and you enter a hallowed space where everything is cleanly and calmly in order and ancient traditions prevail.

Old abdi dalem or court retainers walk about with a dignity that is missing in the younger generations. Sundays and Wednesdays, the strains of silvery gamelan filter through the hallowed spaces as perfect classical dance performances entertain those who are interested. People are polite and refined with courtey manner. Surrounding the Kraton are the homes of the Palace servants and craftspeople and even today if you take a walk through the narrow lanes, you will possibly get a whiff of heating wax as they fire up to draw intricate and age old patterns on the raw cloth in preparation for the dyeing processes which are involved with batik production.

Sri Sultan Hamengubuwono X is the reigning Sultan and what makes Yogyakarta especially interesting is that during the leadup to Indonesia’s fight for Independence, most of Indonesia’s Royal Kingdoms sided with the Dutch rather than their own people and the young leader, Sukarno, who later became the nation’s first President. Because of the Sultan’s loyalty, he was rewarded with the special status on Independence – a status that is still in place today. The current Sultan is also a respected Member of Parliament.

The Kris is Java’s icon. Every man used to own one and they are imbued with magical powers. Even though they are less well regarded now, they are still greatly respected.
This younger brother of the previous Sultan Hangkuwobono 9th is a delightful eccentric who can sometimes be seen talking to palace visitors.
This dignified gentleman was delighted to have his photo taken and displays the perfect Javanese demeanour.
Light and space play such a part in the daily life of the Yogyakarta Kraton or Palace.
Off to work. This abdi dalem or palace guard hurries into work through the ten feet thick palace walls thus entering another quieter more refined world.
The dancer standing in the sidelines awaiting his turn to dance. This classical Javanese dancer cuts a fine figure.
This woman holds the golden umbrella which is a symbol of royalty. When his mid morning tea is delivered, the umbrellas are used to shade the procession as they make their way across the courtyard.
The morning tea procession makes a fine sight and is a daily event in the Yogyakarta Palace. Tea and a huge kettle are carried as well as plates of covered delicacies for the Sultan to enjoy!
The crepe myrtle tree is called Bearong Namu in Korean. It means that the tree flowers for a hundred days. These waiflike flowers are, according to legend, the incarnation of a maiden who waited in vain for a hundred days for her hero to return and then she died heart broken. The hero was away on a quest to slay the monster serpent imugi. As he set out to sea, the hero told the maiden that if he succeeded he would return with a white banner, and with a red banner if he failed. But the banner was indeed white, stained red with the monster’s blood when it was slain. From the maiden’s tomb bloomed red flowers, the maiden’s devoted 100 day prayer for the hero’s return materialized as beautiful blossoms. The flowers came to be called Bearong, or red for a hundred days. So unlike other flowers, the crepe myrtle stays in bloom for a long time in summer.

These photographs are of the crepe myrtle in full bloom at Byeongsan Seawon in Andong South Korea.

Mikyoung Cha is a graduate in Oriental Painting from Hyosung Women’s University, Daegu, South Korea. She has participated in a number of group art exhibitions in South Korea and Japan. In 2016 she took up photography – the camera becoming her paint brush. This globe trotting photographer is a regular contributor to Live Encounters Magazine.
E
Patricia studied Visual Education and Communication at Dun Laoghaire College of Art & Design (IADT) and also holds a first class honours degree in Philosophy and Sociology from University College, Dublin. Her first book *Healing Creations: Discover your mindful self through mandala colouring and journaling* was published in September 2016 by The Collins Press. She hosts workshops on the art of mandala and meditation both in Ireland and abroad. You can see more about her work at [www.healingcreations.ie](http://www.healingcreations.ie)

---

**Mantra of The Mandala for September**

**Symbol**

*by Patricia Fitzgerald*

This mandala is all about the dream world. The symbol in the centre is one that I saw in a dream. I believe in the power of dreams. I believe in the power of symbol. Both in the waking and the sleeping worlds, we are surrounded by symbols and messages if only we have the eyes to see them. Symbols are imaginative signposts pointing us the right way in our lives.

Often in our education system, particularly in the west, we learn a rational language. We learn to think with the left side of our brain. We often learn that that is the only way, or the correct way. But by using the right side of the brain we can tap into a whole new world of intuition and imagination. Words are not the whole truth; often they can be someone else's truth. You need also to travel alone, in silence, with awareness. It is then that the world of symbol and synchronicity reveals itself. Symbols have a language that can be so powerful in leading us in our true authentic direction in life.

[www.healingcreations.ie](http://www.healingcreations.ie)

[www.facebook.com/healingcreationsbymandalaflame](http://www.facebook.com/healingcreationsbymandalaflame)
Prayer and Meditation

In this series on self-healing and transformation, prayer and meditation play an important part. Given these writings are from the book 12 Weeks to Self-Healing: Transforming Pain through Energy Medicine, this Live Encounters article will not be an overview of world-wide prayer and meditation practices, but rather some of my own experiences and some tools for developing a practice.

When you have experienced pain or illness for a long period, I would imagine you turned to prayer. In exploring how important prayer is, let’s examine and revisit the way in which you pray.

Prayer

A verse in the Christian New Testament Bible assures that, “You will receive all that you pray for, provided you have faith” (Matthew 21:22). The way your parents and grandparents prayed may be different from how you pray today. Dr. Larry Dossey writes extensively about the power of prayer and healing in his 1993 book, *Healing Words*. In it, he cites a study by Herbert Benson of Harvard University Medical School.

Working with his fellow researcher and physiologist, Robert Keith Wallace, Benson showed that when subjects meditated with a mantra that consisted of an Asian word containing no meaning for the meditator, with use it became charged with ritualistic value, and healthful body changes occurred. These included lower blood pressure, slower heart rate, and lower metabolic rates. Benson believed there was no magic in the mantra.

To test this suspicion, he taught people to meditate using the word one or any other phrase they found comfortable. He then studied Christians and Jews who prayed regularly. He asked Catholics to use mantra phrases such as “Hail Mary, full of grace,” or “Lord Jesus Christ, have mercy upon me.” Jews mainly used either the peace greeting of *shalom* or *echad*, which means “one.” Protestants frequently chose the first line of the Lord’s Prayer, “Our Father who art in heaven,” or “The Lord is my shepherd,” which is the opening of the Twenty-third Psalm. All of the mantras worked, and all were equally effective in stimulating the healthful physiological changes in the body that Benson called the “relaxation response.” But Benson also found that those who used the word one, or similar simple phrases, didn’t stick with the program. Conversely, those who used prayers rather than meaningless phrases continued.
Concentration Meditation

When practicing concentration meditation, you focus your attention on your breath, an image, or a sound (mantra) in order to still your mind and allow a greater awareness and clarity to emerge. This is similar to zooming in and narrowing the focus to a particular object or field.

Breathing Meditation

The most common meditation practice is focusing on your breath. Through this continued focus, the “mind clutter” begins to quiet, and you gain a sense of calmness and relaxation. Over time and with practice, the thoughts that were once racing or popping into your mind calm down, and a sense of peace takes over. As you focus on the breath, the rhythmic inhalation and exhalation deepens the breathing, and your mind and body become tranquil.

A more intense practice of focusing on the breath is pranayama breathing, which is a yogic practice. According to Swami Sivananda Rha, this is a process of breath control. She says the purpose of this type of meditation is to connect with the cosmos and gain control over your central nervous system and mind. It is best practiced with character building and to learn to manage the lower physical self. This is a practice of alternate nostril breathing. “Character building” and “managing your lower physical self” means taking control over your thoughts and behaviors that no longer serve you, while creating new, positive, healthy thoughts and behaviors.

I first became aware of pranayama breathing when I traveled to India with a friend of mine who has a home in India but currently lives in the United States. He said that his uncle taught him this practice. When we were at his home in Kolkata (formerly Calcutta), he sat cross-legged on the floor every morning and practiced this breathing for twenty to thirty minutes. This practice increases the sense of peace takes over. As you focus on the breath, the rhythmic inhalation and exhalation deepens the breathing, and your mind and body become tranquil.

Prayer (contd...)

One way to pray is to be repetitive and this study shows using a word or words that are meaningful to you, affect your consistency. If you have ever used prayer beads or the rosary, you know this. Recital is another form of prayer. Many people use scripture from their religion as prayer. They may do this repetitively, or they may read scripture and then reflect on what it means. Others talk to God, Buddha, Allah, or their Higher Power as they would to a friend. I have often heard it said that prayer is talking to God, and meditation is listening.

Journaling is another way to connect with the Divine. “Dear God” letters are often effective in clarifying where you have become stuck. Having a heart full of gratitude is another way of praying. When you expand your view of prayer this way, you may find that you pray often through the day. I am a believer in the notion that whatever we focus on becomes greater and grander in our lives, so take some time to focus on gratitude and love. See how this affects your pain.

Meditation

Before I share with you about meditation, I want to acknowledge that you may experience resistance to meditation at first. You may be fearful to sit and really experience what you are thinking or feeling, or you may not want to become aware of the sensations in your body. Even this morning as I awoke, I quickly shifted my thoughts from meditation to something else. Why did I do that? Why was I so afraid to listen to what my mind was saying? Usually I awoke with new ideas and plans and creative ventures. This morning I didn’t want to hear what I was thinking. I went back to catch the thought, and it was gone. When I sat up to read on my Kindle, I felt good. I looked at the calendar in my iPhone, and my day was set to write. It was a good day. What was I afraid to think about? I am sure it will surface in my meditation.

You may have this same experience. You may think there is just too much information in your mind, and you would never be able to quiet yourself, but it’s really not so difficult. Take a moment and just sit with your eyes open. Look at what is in front of you. Look at whatever you see and focus on the detail. Experience your senses. Feel the chair under you. Notice how your breath changes. You are becoming more aware, more awake, more alive, and you are beginning to come to a meditative state. Another way to do this is to close your eyes and listen. Listen to the sounds that are far away. Now listen to the sounds that are close by. Allow yourself to become more aware and more meditative!

Here are a few choices to begin a meditation practice.

Concentration Meditation

When practicing concentration meditation, you focus your attention on your breath, an image, or a sound (mantra) in order to still your mind and allow a greater awareness and clarity to emerge. This is similar to zooming in and narrowing the focus to a particular object or field.
Focusing on an Object

Focusing on an object is another choice for concentration meditation. There are several objects you can use, but I suggest you find one that is pleasing to you. You could focus on an external object such as a candle flame, a bowl, a flower, or a photo of someone you love. You could also choose a photo of Jesus, Buddha, or an angel. Another method is to focus in the center of your head—the space above and behind your eyes, in the middle of your head. This is a place of neutrality. You may instead choose to focus either between your eyes or in the center of your heart. Another commonplace to practice focus is in your belly, three fingers below your belly button and inside a few inches. The conscious focus in the above examples is on the candle, photo, or particular body part. However, in focusing on those literal objects, you become aware of the breathing as well, and you experience a calm, relaxed, tranquil state of being.

Using a Mantra

A third concentration meditation involves using a mantra. A mantra is a short phrase with an easy rhythm used to increase results. A mantra is used to suggest a favorable state of being. My favorite walking mantra is, “I am strong, healthy, and fit.” Mantras originated in the Vedic tradition of enlightenment in India and have since been incorporated by many traditions.

According to “The Power of Mantra Chanting,” an article by Gyan Rajhans, “The sacred utterances or chanting of Sanskrit Mantras provide us with the power to attain our goals and lift ourselves from the ordinary to the higher level of consciousness.” This is believed to be so because “different sounds have different effects on the human psyche.” Repeating a mantra is a spiritual technique that calms the mind and makes one more attuned to Spirit.

Mindfulness Meditation

The practice of mindfulness meditation comes from Buddhism and has been also been taught by many in the West. In mindfulness meditation, you focus on the present moment and not the past or the future. While you notice your thoughts, you realize that they are just thoughts and let them go by. This is done with awareness that your thoughts are simply your thoughts, and that you are not your thoughts. This meditation can be done at any time. It is a daily practice of awareness in the present moment.

There are many ways to practice mindfulness meditation. One that I particularly enjoy is to focus on the sounds close by and then the sounds that are far away. This takes me into a state of meditation that I enjoy, which is just being present.

Guided Meditation

Guided meditation is similar to hypnotherapy. In guided meditation, a person or a recorded script guides you into a meditative state. You can also take yourself through guided imagery with a script or with awareness of the images you would like to create.

As with hypnotherapy, guided imagery uses all of your senses, yet guided imagery is different in that it focuses and directs your imagination. When your mind is imagining, your body responds as if what it sees is true. An example of this might include imagining a vacation. Let’s pick a beach resort. As you are sitting at your desk at work, you find yourself drifting to the beach, feeling the sun on your face, smelling the sea, and imagining the taste of a fresh, cold lemonade next to you. Your body may relax as your breathing slows down and time speeds up. This is an example of going into trance and experiencing whatever you imagine.

Guided imagery is used for many purposes, and the imagery selected will depend on your goal. For instance, if you want to manage your pain, the imagery may be full of metaphors that help you to connect with your subconscious mind. For example, when I awake in the morning with pain in my neck from sleeping, during meditation I image a blue light coming down from the top of my head into the painful areas of my neck and shoulders. As I do this, I see the blue light cooling off the inflammation in my neck and shoulders. Within a minute or so, the pain is gone. (Remember that I have been practicing for quite some time, and this technique is a result of the practice. Do not be discouraged if you try this and it does not work for you immediately. Keep practicing!)

If you are interested in learning a guided meditation that teaches you self-healing tools and takes you through a process of clearing your chakras, you can use my CD, Chakra Clearing. (Mark please link)

Make no mistake, whether prayer or meditation, the process stills the chatter and voices within so you can hear your own inner guidance—the voice of the Divine, God, the Goddess or your Guides. Prayer and meditation allow you to open yourself to wisdom and healing beyond what your Ego dictates or allows. No matter what you call it, when you achieve inner peace, you affect the world around you by increasing the peace of others.

You can find more information about the book HERE
We Turks love eggs done many different ways; one of our favorite ways to enjoy egg is as being poached and served over garlic yoghurt, a special dish called Cilbir, in Turkish. Cilbir is generally enjoyed as a hot mezze though I like serving as lunch or a light supper, along with a refreshing salad like Coban Salata, Shepherd's Salad with cucumbers, tomatoes, spring onions and some pide bread or crusty bread.

I also like to prepare a simple red pepper flakes infused olive oil sauce and pour this over the poached eggs with garlic yoghurt, just before serving. The delicious heat from the red pepper flakes complements the dish beautifully.

I hope you enjoy this simple yet very satisfying dish, Afiyet Olsun. Also, my very best wishes for a wonderful festive season to you all, in good health and happiness.

Afiyet Olsun,

Ozlem
Poached Eggs with Garlic Yoghurt, Turkish Style – Cilbir. Pic © Ozlem Warren

Serves 2 people

Ingredients:

- 1 small garlic clove, crushed and chopped finely
- 1 cup / 8 fl. oz. plain thick yoghurt, brought to room temperature
- 2 large free range eggs
- 30 ml / 2 tbsp. olive oil
- 30 ml / 2 tbsp. white wine vinegar
- 10 ml / 2 tsp. Turkish pul biber, red pepper flakes or chili flakes
- Salt and freshly ground black pepper to taste
- Pide bread or crusty bread to serve

Instructions

1. Prepare the garlic yoghurt first – about 10, 15 minutes before poaching the eggs – and bring to the room temperature.
2. In a small bowl, beat the yoghurt with garlic and seasoning. Spoon this into two serving plates, creating a round thick layer to provide a nest for the poached egg. Let the yoghurt mixture reach the room temperature.
3. Fill a small pan with hot water, add the vinegar (this will help sealing the egg whites) and bring to a boil. Stir the water to create a whirlpool and crack in the first egg.
4. As the egg spins and the white sets around the yolk, stir the water ready for the next one. Poach each egg for 2-3 minutes so that the yolk remains soft.
5. While the eggs are poaching, quickly pour in the olive oil in a small pan and stir in the Turkish pul biber, red pepper flakes or chili flakes, over medium to high heat. Stir and let the red pepper flakes infuse to olive oil for a few minutes, turn the heat off.
6. Lift the eggs out of the water with a slotted spoon and place them over the garlic yoghurt spread.
7. Drizzle the red pepper flakes infused olive oil over the poached eggs. Serve immediately with pide bread or crusty bread by the side.
8. Coban Salata, Shepherd’s Salad with cucumbers, tomatoes, spring onions would also go well with this delicious poached eggs over garlic yoghurt, Cilbir; Afiyet Olsun.

© Ozlem Warren
Celebrating 7 years 2010-2016

Live encounters

Free Online Magazine From Village Earth
September 2017

Photograph of Bimal Roy courtesy Joy Roy